DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY



OFFICE OF THE CHIEF OF ENGINEERS WASHINGTON, D.C. 20310-2600

REPLY TO ATTENTION OF

CECW-PM (1105-2-10a)

DEC 3 0 2003

SUBJECT: Silver Strand Shoreline, Imperial Beach, California

THE SECRETARY OF THE ARMY

- 1. I submit for transmission to Congress my report on the study of storm damage reduction through beach nourishment in the City of Imperial Beach, San Diego County, California. It is accompanied by the report of the district and division engineers. These reports constitute a general reevaluation of the storm damage reduction project authorized in Section 101 of the Rivers and Harbors Act of 1958, for the Silver Strand shoreline at Imperial Beach. Preconstruction engineering and design activities for this project will be continued under this authority.
- 2. The reporting officers recommend authorization of a plan to reduce storm damages along the shoreline in the City of Imperial Beach. The recommended plan calls for initial construction of a 32-meter-wide (105 feet) beach nourishment project along a 2,165-meter-long (7,100 feet) stretch of shoreline, with periodic renourishment on the average every 10 years over a 50-year period of Federal participation, for a total of four additional nourishments. This plan would provide shoreline erosion control throughout the project reach, a high degree of protection against storm-related damage to structures, and maintenance of the existing recreational beach. The recommended plan is the national economic development (NED) plan. No fish and wildlife mitigation is required.
- 3. At October 2003 prices, the estimated total first cost of the project is about \$11,758,000. Based upon the requirements of the Water Resources Development Act (WRDA) of 1986, as amended, cost sharing for the initial project would be 64 percent or \$7,506,000 Federal and 36 percent or \$4,252,000 non-Federal, based on current shoreline development and use. The total cost for each 10-year interval nourishment is estimated at \$8,551,000. Cumulative performance monitoring costs are estimated at \$2,300,000 over the 50-year period of Federal participation in the project. Total nourishment costs are estimated at \$36,506,000. Cost sharing for periodic renourishment would be 50 percent Federal and 50 percent non-Federal, based upon the requirements of WRDA 1999 and based on current shoreline development and use. The resulting Federal share of the periodic renourishment would be \$18,253,000, and the non-Federal share would be \$18,253,000. The equivalent

SUBJECT: Silver Strand Shoreline, Imperial Beach, California

annual cost of periodic nourishment would be \$627,000, of which \$313,500 would be Federal and \$313,500 would be non-Federal. The ultimate project cost, including the initial construction and cumulative periodic renourishment costs, is estimated at \$48,264,000, of which \$25,759,000 is Federal cost and \$22,505,000 is non-Federal cost. Operation, maintenance, repair, replacement, and rehabilitation (OMRR&R) costs would be the responsibility of the non-Federal sponsor. Annual OMRR&R costs are estimated at \$60,000. The non-Federal sponsor is the city of Imperial Beach.

- 4. Average annual storm damage reduction benefits associated with the recommended plan, reflecting a 50-year period of economic analysis and a 5 5/8 percent discount rate, total \$1,698,000. Average annual recreation benefits associated with the recommended plan total \$735,000. With annual costs of \$1,448,000 and total average annual benefits of \$2,433,000, the resulting benefit-to-cost ratio is 1.7 to 1. Net benefits total \$985,000.
- 5. Washington level review indicates that the plan recommended by the reporting officers is technically sound, economically justified, and environmentally and socially acceptable. The proposed project complies with applicable Corps planning procedures and regulations. Also, the views of interested parties, including Federal, State and local agencies, have been considered.
- 6. I concur in the findings, conclusions, and recommendation of the reporting officers. Accordingly, I recommend that beach nourishment for storm damage reduction on the Silver Strand shoreline at Imperial Beach be authorized in accordance with the reporting officers' recommended plan. This recommendation is subject to cost sharing, financing, and other applicable requirements of Federal and State laws and policies, including WRDA 1986, as amended. Federal implementation of the authorized project would be subject to the non-Federal sponsor agreeing to comply with applicable Federal laws and policies, including but not limited to:
- a. Provide 35 percent of initial project costs assigned to hurricane and storm damage reduction plus 100 percent of initial project costs assigned to protecting undeveloped private lands and other private shores which do not provide public benefits and 50 percent of periodic nourishment costs assigned to hurricane and storm damage reduction plus 100 percent of periodic nourishment costs assigned to protecting undeveloped private lands and other private shores which do not provide public benefits and as further specified below:
- (1) Enter into an agreement that provides, prior to construction, 25 percent of design costs.
- (2) Provide, during construction, any additional funds needed to cover the non-Federal share of design costs.

SUBJECT: Silver Strand Shoreline, Imperial Beach, California

- (3) Provide all lands, easements, and rights-of-way, and suitable dredged or excavated material disposal areas, and perform or ensure the performance of any relocations determined by the Federal Government to be necessary for the initial construction, periodic nourishment, operation, and maintenance of the project.
- (4) Provide, during construction, any additional amounts as are necessary to make its total contribution equal to 35 percent of initial project costs assigned to hurricane and storm damage reduction plus 100 percent of initial project costs assigned to protecting undeveloped private lands and other private shores which do not provide public benefits and 50 percent of periodic nourishment costs assigned to hurricane and storm damage reduction plus 100 percent of periodic nourishment costs assigned to protecting undeveloped private lands and other private shores which do not provide public benefits.
- b. For so long as the project remains authorized, operate, maintain, repair, replace, and rehabilitate the completed project, or functional portion of the project, at no cost to the Federal Government, in a manner compatible with the project authorized purposes and in accordance with applicable Federal and State laws and regulations and any specific directions prescribed by the Federal Government.
- c. Give the Federal Government a right to enter, at reasonable times and in a reasonable manner, upon property that the non-Federal sponsor now or hereafter owns or controls for access to the project for the purpose of inspecting, operating, maintaining, repairing, replacing, rehabilitating, or completing the project. No completion, operation, maintenance, repair, replacement, or rehabilitation by the Federal Government shall relieve the non-Federal sponsor of responsibility to meet the non-Federal sponsor's obligations, or to preclude the Federal Government from pursuing any other remedy at law or equity to ensure faithful performance.
- d. Hold and save the United States free from all damages arising from the initial construction, periodic nourishment, operation, maintenance, repair, replacement, and rehabilitation of the project and any project-related betterments, except for damages due to the fault or negligence of the United States or its contractors.
- e. Keep and maintain books, records, documents, and other evidence pertaining to costs and expenses incurred pursuant to the project in accordance with the standards for financial management systems set forth in the Uniform Administrative Requirements for Grants and Cooperative Agreements to State and Local Governments at 32 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Section 33.20.

SUBJECT: Silver Strand Shoreline, Imperial Beach, California

- f. Perform, or cause to be performed, any investigations for hazardous substances that are determined necessary to identify the existence and extent of any hazardous substances regulated under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA), Public Law 96-510, as amended, 42 U.S.C. 9601-9675, that may exist in, on, or under lands, easements, or rights-of-way that the Federal Government determines to be required for the initial construction, periodic nourishment, operation, and maintenance of the project. However, for lands that the Federal Government determines to be subject to the navigation servitude, only the Federal Government shall perform such investigations unless the Federal Government provides the non-Federal sponsor with prior specific written direction, in which case the non-Federal sponsor shall perform such investigations in accordance with such written direction.
- g. Assume complete financial responsibility for all necessary cleanup and response costs of any CERCLA regulated materials located in, on, or under lands, easements, or rights-of-way that the Federal Government determines to be necessary for the initial construction, periodic nourishment, operation, or maintenance of the project.
- h. Agree that the non-Federal sponsor shall be considered the operator of the project for the purpose of CERCLA liability, and to the maximum extent practicable, operate, maintain, and repair the project in a manner that will not cause liability to arise under CERCLA.
- i. If applicable, comply with the applicable provisions of the Uniform Relocation Assistance and Real Property Acquisition Policies Act of 1970, Public Law 91-646, as amended by Title IV of the Surface Transportation and Uniform Relocation Assistance Act of 1987 (Public Law 100-17), and the Uniform Regulations contained in 49 CFR Part 24, in acquiring lands, easements, and rights-of-way required for the initial construction, periodic nourishment, operation, and maintenance of the project, including those necessary for relocations, borrow materials, and dredged or excavated material disposal, and inform all affected persons of applicable benefits, policies, and procedures in connection with said act.
- j. Comply with all applicable Federal and State laws and regulations, including, but not limited to, Section 601 of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, Public Law 88-352 (42 U.S.C. 2000d), and Department of Defense Directive 5500.11 issued pursuant thereto, as well as Army Regulation 600-7, entitled "Nondiscrimination on the Basis of Handicap in Programs and Activities Assisted or Conducted by the Department of the Army," and Section 402 of the Water Resources Development Act of 1986, as amended (33 U.S.C. 701b-12), requiring non-Federal preparation and implementation of floodplain management plans.

CECW-PM

SUBJECT: Silver Strand Shoreline, Imperial Beach, California

- k. Provide the non-Federal share of that portion of the costs of mitigation and data recovery activities associated with historic preservation, that are in excess of 1 percent of the total amount authorized to be appropriated for the project, in accordance with the cost sharing provisions of the agreement.
- 1. Participate in and comply with applicable Federal floodplain management and flood insurance programs.
- m. Do not use Federal funds to meet the non-Federal sponsor's share of total project costs unless the Federal granting agency verifies in writing that the expenditure of such funds is authorized.
- n. Prescribe and enforce regulations to prevent obstruction of or encroachment on the project that would reduce the level of protection it affords or that would hinder future periodic nourishment and/or the operation and maintenance of the project.
- o. Not less than once each year, inform affected interests of the extent of protection afforded by the project.
- p. Publicize floodplain information in the area concerned and provide this information to zoning and other regulatory agencies for their use in preventing unwise future development in the floodplain, and in adopting such regulations as may be necessary to prevent unwise future development and to ensure compatibility with protection levels provided by the project.
- q. For so long as the project remains authorized, ensure continued conditions of public ownership and use of the shore upon which the amount of Federal participation is based.
- r. For so long as the project remains authorized, provide and maintain necessary access roads, parking areas, and other public use facilities, open and available to all on equal terms.
- s. Recognize and support the requirements of Section 221 of Public Law 91-611, Flood Control Act of 1970, as amended, and Section 103 of the Water Resources Development Act of 1986, Public Law 99-662, as amended, which provides that the Secretary of the Army shall not commence the construction of any water resources project or separable element thereof, until the non-Federal sponsor has entered into a written agreement to furnish its required cooperation for the project or separable element.

CECW-PM

SUBJECT: Silver Strand Shoreline, Imperial Beach, California

- t. At least twice annually and after storm events, perform surveillance of the beach to determine losses of nourishment material from the project design section and provide the results of such surveillance to the Federal Government.
- 7. The recommendation contained herein reflects the information available at this time and current departmental policies governing formulation of individual projects. It does not reflect program and budgeting priorities in the formulation of a national civil works construction program nor the perspective of higher review levels within the executive branch. Consequently, the recommendation may be modified before it is transmitted to the Congress as a proposal for authorization and implementation funding. However, prior to transmittal to the Congress, the sponsor, the State, interested Federal agencies, and other parties will be advised of any significant modifications and will be afforded an opportunity to comment further.

ROBERT B. LOWERS

Lieutenant General, U.S. Army

Chief of Engineers